

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Blakebrough, R. Chapman, D. Edwards,  
R. Harris, B. Hayward, J. Higginson, M. Powell, B. Strong, A. Webb  
and A. Wintle

**ALSO IN ATTENDANCE:** County Councillors P.A.D. Hobson and  
P. Farley

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Paula Clarke	Development Management Area Team Manager
Mark Davies	Highway Development Manager
Andrew Jones	Senior Development Management Officer
Paula Harris	Democratic Services Officer

The Chair took the opportunity to give thanks to Members and Officers for the help and support given during the last five years and spoke of the challenging decisions the committee have made during this term. The Chair spoke of the introduction of public speaking, the benefit of pre application advice and the introduction of live streaming.

Thanks was given to members of the Delegation Panel County Councillor Roger Harris and County Councillor Peter Clarke who meet on a weekly basis speaking to applicants and objectors.

The entire Planning team of officers was thanked, headed up by Mark Hand, for their diligent work and attention to detail.

The Chair thanked the sixteen Planning Committee Members for their attention to detail and their excellent attendance.

The Chair gave emphatic thanks to Richard Williams, the committee's regular Democratic Services Officer for all his hard work and organisation before, during and after each meeting.

Finally thanks were given to Robert Tranter, the officer responsible for legal advice, County Councillor Peter Clarke as Vice Chair and County Councillor Roger Harris as spokesperson of the opposition.

### **1. Apologies**

County Councillors: D. Dovey, D. Evans, P. Murphy and P. Watts.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

### **2. Declarations of Interest**

None received.

### **3. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 4<sup>th</sup> April 2017 were confirmed and signed by the Chair with one amendment from County Councillor B. Strong.

County Councillor ask that in regard to the Maryport Decision on page 11, bullet point 7 the Councillor had stated 'if the application is agreed today it would give the inspector of the enquiry permission to agree to the two dwellings'. The Councillor also commented that he had previously asked for the item to be deferred until the appeal had been considered by the inspector. County Councillor asked that the minutes reflect this.

### **4. Application DC/2016/00041 - The Proposal Seeks To Provide A Carpark, Alongside Wyebridge Street, With Capacity For 39 Spaces; The Site Is Currently A Greenfield Area Wyebridge Street, Monmouth, NP25 3DL**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

Mr. D. Cummings, speaking in support of the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- There has been lobbying carried out for a carpark at this location since the mid 1980's.
- The Chamber was sympathetic to residents of Granville Street because in the original plan, prior to 2016, the proposed entrance and exit, would have been via this narrow road.
- An alternative entrance was proposed on land owned by Monmouthshire Housing Association on St James Street, however this was not viable.
- After checking with air quality experts regarding the number of movements at the new carpark they state that the effects are so low that they are not measureable.
- Having an entrance only accessible from the A40 is not ideal as it cannot be accessed from the town.
- The Chamber is pleased that the appropriate lighting has been factored into the application.
- It is hoped the carpark will be completed by the 1<sup>st</sup> September 2017.

The local Member, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm

- The carpark is a long time coming and although it does get wet at the bottom end of the carpark when the flood defences come into operation there are no other problems there.
- He stated he is not happy with the entrance coming off Wyebridge Street.
- The Member hoped that at the exit of the carpark there would be sufficient signage to stop cars turning left back onto the dual carriageway.

In noting the detail of the application, some Members expressed the following points in regard to the application:

- Low level lighting would be preferable.
- Disappointment that the capacity of the carpark will be 39 as opposed to the original application which had 60 spaces.
- Although this will help the parking issues, more spaces are needed.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor A. Wintle and seconded by County Councillor B. Haywood that application DC/2016/00041 be approved subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 11

Against approval – 1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00041 be approved subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

#### **5. Application DC/2016/01310 - Change Of Use Of Land To Provide Six Trailer Tents For Tourism Use, Provision Of Grass-Crete Car Park Area And Alterations To The Existing Field Access Land At Llanfair Kilgeddin, Nr Abergavenny, NP7 9DY**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the 15 conditions, as outlined in the report.

Councillor G. Thomas, representing Llanover Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- It was felt that this application was premature as two documents are in the process of being provided.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

- Firstly, a Welsh Assembly funded appraisal of the potential and risks of flooding in the village and secondly a draft supplementary planning guide to glamping.
- Whilst it was accepted that tourism is essential to Monmouthshire, there is no statistical evidence at present to suggest the need for an additional glamping site in the County.
- The dimensions of the trailer tent was given as being larger than a ten berth static caravan.
- During certain months, due to the deciduous trees surrounding the site the trailer tents will be visible to surrounding properties.
- It was asked that this application is deferred.

The applicant, Mr. A. Fenner, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Extensive research was carried out which showed a growing demand in Monmouthshire for all year round, high value, sustainable tourism.
- The tourists visiting the site would spend money in local businesses including the farm shop, the Foxhunter Public House and the Hummingbird café in Llanover.
- The applicant lives locally to maintain the site and intends to source all suppliers locally
- A planning consultant was employed by the applicant to ensure the application meets all the current planning policies and input was sought from County Councillor Sara Jones, Assembly Member Nick Ramsey and local residents to develop and refine this application.
- The site is not inside Welsh Water or the County Council's flood risk area.
- Monmouthshire County Council's Highway Department commented that it would enhance the safety of vehicles using the adjacent County class III highway.
- Extensive planting will take place on the land including a heritage orchard and many areas of flower meadows.
- Work has been undertaken with the nearest neighbour with plans to remove fences to allow access to the footpath to Nantyerry.
- During the two month closed period the tents will be removed from the land for waterproofing, the agricultural trailers being moved to the grasscrete area.
- Work is being undertaken with Wildlife Trust and the Monmouthshire Meadows Conservation Group to enhance native plants and wildlife habitats.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm

In noting the detail of the application, some Members expressed the following points in regard to the application:

- Clarification was sought on the size of the carpark and we were advised by officers that it totals 1000 square metres. A condition is proposed in relation to this.
- Lighting provision was questioned and an officer told us that there is no lighting proposed at the request of Monmouthshire County Council's ecology officers.
- The seasonal operating period-of the site was questioned as being excessive.
- Officers felt that tourism is an all year round activity.
- When asked if the trailer tents would have electricity we were advised that they would.
- The nearest residential property is 65 metres away on the opposite side of the carriageway.
- Sustainable tourism is essential to the County's economy.
- A question was raised regarding the flood report and we were told that the site sits 0.3 miles outside of any flood zones and no non-porous surfaces were proposed on site. A condition is proposed relating to drainage details.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor R. Chapman and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DC/2016/01310 be approved subject to the fifteen conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 10  
Abstentions – 2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/01310 be approved subject to the fifteen conditions, as outlined in the report. Add lighting condition in late correspondence

**Application DC/2014/01290 - Redevelopment Of The Site To Create A New Neighbourhood Including: A Range Of New Homes (Apartments, Houses And Some Sheltered Accommodation For The Elderly - Use Classes C2 And C3); New Offices And Workshops (Use Class B1); New Commercial Leisure Facilities (Use Classes A1 And A3); The Retention And Flexible Change Of Use Of Brunel House To Commercial, Residential And / Or Community Uses (Use Class A1, A3, B1, C2, D1 And D2); A Network Of Open Spaces Including A New Riverside Linear Park, Footpaths, Public Open Space And Areas**

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm

**For Informal Recreation; Highways Infrastructure Including Accesses And Paths; And Requiring: Site Clearance And Demolition Works, Treatment And Preparation, The Installation Of New Services And Infrastructure, The Creation Of New Treatment/Amenity Wetlands And Drainage Channels, Ecological Mitigation And Enhancement Works (Including Improvements To The Beaufort Quarry) And Improvements / Works To The Highways Network And Other Ancillary works and activities, Mabley Bridge, Station, Chepstow**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to conditions, as outlined in the report (and as amended in late correspondence) and subject to a Section 106 Agreement and a Section 278 Agreement, as also outlined in the report.

Councillor D. Rooke, representing Chepstow Town Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Chepstow Town Council recommend approval of this application with reservations, mainly the traffic analysis and flooding risks.
- Capacity of A48 needs to be considered with focus on key times of the day.
- Disappointment voiced at the level of social housing this development offers.
- Hope that the County Council ensures that social housing is spread across the site.
- Look to a long term solution to the traffic issue by communicating with the neighbouring authority Gloucestershire County Council.

A local resident Jez Becker, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Concerns for the extra traffic proposals.
- Positivity for the development as it captures the historical nature of the site.
- Disappointment at the low level of affordable housing.

The local Member, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Praise for the way the development has been approached and the evidence of cross border thinking.
- Concern for the amount of affordable housing offered by the development.
- The need for affordable housing for existing residents.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

Cabinet Member for Social Housing, County Councillor Phyl Hobson, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Disappointed by the low affordable housing figures.
- Affordable housing opportunities by developing the offered 1.5 acres of land. Accessing Welsh Government grant funding and working with two housing associations.
- Young working families unable to get onto the housing ladder due to the high property prices.
- If land values increase after the lowering of the Severn Bridge tolls it was asked if we could revisit the price offered by the developer.
- Requested that the S106 be worded to keep options open to allow the 1.5 acres of land to be developed in innovative ways for affordable housing as being promoted by the Welsh Government.

The agent for the development Tim Gent, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

The wish for a high quality, sustainable development for one of Monmouthshire's largest brown field site.

The development being a major economic boost for Monmouthshire.

In noting the detail of the application, some Members expressed the following points in regard to the application:

- Members were unanimous in voicing their disappointment at the low level of affordable housing provision.
- A Member asked that the district valuer's viability appraisal for the land could be revisited if land or property prices increase.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor J. Higginson and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2014/01290 be approved subject to the forty-three conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm

For approval - 11

Against approval - 1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2014/01290 be approved subject to the amended conditions in late correspondence and the S106 and S278, with delegated authority for the Head of Planning to conclude if condition 11 is needed, but also subject to the Head of Planning first trying to negotiate more housing land for affordable housing. There is agreement from Committee to report back on that to the Delegation Panel. There was need for a 'Design Code' condition to be added too - to ensure the continuity of design throughout the development site, as discussed with Members

**County Councillor M. Powell left the meeting following determination of application DC/2014/01290 and did not return.**

**7. Application DC/2016/01206 - Construction Of A New Garden Storage Building In Association With Upper Llananant, Penallt Including Change Of Use Of Woodland To Be Included Within The Garden Curtilage. Upper Llananant Farm, Pentwyn Lane, Penallt, NP25 4AP**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence, which was presented for refusal subject to the one reason, as outlined in the report.

This application had been deferred at the Planning Committee Meeting on 4th April 2017, as Members had been minded to refuse the application and had agreed that it be re-presented to a future Planning Committee Meeting with an appropriate reason for refusal.

An amended plan was put before Members reducing the size of the proposed outbuilding but Members considered the amended proposal to be still too large and resolved to refuse the application for the reason given in the report

The local Member, also a Planning Committee Member, made the following points:

- The storage building is too big for domestic use.
- It was asked that any future amendments go back to the Community Council to review.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Blakebrough and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that application DC/2016/01206 be refused subject to the one reason as outlined in the report - amended (smaller) scheme refused.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal - 11

For approval - 1



## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 25th April, 2017 at 2.00 pm**

The proposition was refused.

We resolved that application DC/2016/01206 be refused as per the six reasons, as outlined in the report - amended (smaller) scheme refused.

### **8. Planning Appeals received between 25/2/2017 and 11/4/2017**

We received and noted the appeals received.

**The meeting ended at 4.17 pm**